LYING ABOUT TONALITY:
A New World of Topic in Early Twentieth Century Modernist Music

Tom Johnson—The Graduate Center, CUNY

EXAMPLE 1A: Manifestations of Tonality-as-Topic with /C-Major triad/ figura in order of appearance in talk.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>PIECE</th>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>OCCURRENCE</th>
<th>POSSIBLE TONAL SIGNIFIED(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Berg</td>
<td>Wozzeck</td>
<td>1922</td>
<td>Act II, Scene 1, m. 116</td>
<td>Hackneyed, banal, bourgeois complacency (Straus 1990)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ives</td>
<td>Psalm 67</td>
<td>1894</td>
<td>Opening</td>
<td>Chorale, nostalgia, reverence (Burkholder 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartók</td>
<td>Bluebeard’s Castle</td>
<td>1911</td>
<td>Fifth Door Scene, R. 73</td>
<td>Pastoral grandeur, light, reverence (Antokoletz and Antokoletz 2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartók</td>
<td>String Quartet 5</td>
<td>1934</td>
<td>Mvmt. II, m. 45</td>
<td>Stability, otherness, familiarity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penderecki</td>
<td>Polymorphia</td>
<td>1973</td>
<td>Ending</td>
<td>Humor, surprise, uncanny familiarity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EXAMPLE 1B. Potential/partial code of tonality-as-topic negotiated in examples of C major figura.
SELECTED SCORE EXCERPTS AND EXAMPLES in order of appearance in the talk:


SCHOENBERG, Op. 14/1: mm. 5–10 with motion towards tonal respite. Key tonal “symbols” marked.
SCHOENBERG OP. 19/4: mm. 1–5 with Forte’s (2003) annotations below the score. Key tetrachords are marked. Each has aspects of triadic-ness and tonal allusiveness.
SCHOENBERG OP. 19/4: Full score with Almén’s (2008) topic labels.

A: dance topic

B: recitative

A’: parody of A and B
**SCHÖNBERG OP. 19/4:** mm. 1–5 with tonality-as-topic guiding a narrative through *figurae* constituting Forte’s “meld of tonal materials.”

---

/MAJOR TRIAD/ FIGURA:
Score excerpts from EXAMPLE 1A, in order of appearance in talk.

- **Berg:** *Wozzeck*, Act II, Scene 1, m. 116.
  - Combined with: /homophony/,
  - /drones/,
  - /dynamic extremes/

- **Ives:** *Psalm 67*, Opening.
  - Combined with: 
    - /homophony/,
    - /triads/,
    - /chorale/
• Bartók: *Bluebeard's Castle*, Fifth Door Scene, R. 73.
  - Combined with: /pentatonicism/, /parallel motion/, /triads/, /homophony/, /dynamic extreme/

• Bartók: *String Quartet* no. 5, II, mm. 45–46.
  - Combined with: /triads/, /homophony/, /dynamic extreme/
SELECTED GLOSSARY:

CULTURAL UNIT: “anything that is culturally defined and distinguished as an entity. It may be a person, place, thing, feeling, state of affairs, sense of foreboding… In American culture such units as uncle, town, blue (depressed)… hope and art are cultural units.” (Schneider, as quoted in Eco 1976, p. 67). For a useful introduction in topic theory terms, see: Monelle 2006, pp. 23–26.

DISTINCTIVE FEATURE: the shared characteristics of phonemes, as in the “voiced” aspect of “duh” and “buh” vs. the unvoiced in “t” and “p.” (Rumph 2014, p. 497)

FIGURAE: the “shared structural features of topics” that, in and of themselves, do not signify topically. Rumph (2011; 2014) via Hjelmslev.

INDEXICALITY OF THE OBJECT: an important distinction in meaning making from Monelle 2000. Essentially, he argues that the meaning of a topic, what it signifies, is not a genre or style itself, but the cultural units surrounding that object. For example: “The pianto, then, is iconic with regard to its object, because it originally imitated the moan of someone in tears; it is indexical with regard to its ultimate signification (the “indexicality of the object”), because it came to mean the emotions associated with one kind of weeping.” (p. 18)

INTERPRETANT: the “third” part of signification for C.S. Peirce that links a signifier to a signified by way of an additional sign.

MARKEDNESS: the asymmetrical meaningfulness and relationship between binary terms. A marked term is typically less frequent and has a narrower range of meanings. In the mid-18th century, the minor mode was marked while the major mode was unmarked; the former had a narrower range of meanings and occurred less frequently than the latter.

MODERNISM: I take from Berman (1982) a basic definition of Modernism and modernity “as any attempt by modern men and women to become subjects as well as objects of modernization, to get a grip on the modern world and make themselves at home in it.” (p. 5). Essentially, it is the reaction to processes of modernization.

PHONEME: the minimal unit of difference between words and sounds in a language. In this paper, figura take on the differentiating feature of phonemes. (Rumph 2014, p. 496–98)

TONALITY: for this project, tonality if fundamentally understood as a constellation of harmonic practices made conventional in eighteenth and nineteenth-century Western classical music. For more on this particular definition, see especially Bryan Hyer’s Grove article, §5.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


